The Paris Black Friday 13/11/2015 Attacks -
What do we know? What should we do?

(Updated: November 15, 2015)
Putting things in context: Terrorism in France

On Friday, November 13, 2015, France witnessed the worst terrorist attack committed inside its territory. France has experienced practically all types of modern manifestations of terrorism: anti-colonialist terrorism in the 1950s; right-wing terrorism in the 1960s; left-wing terrorism in the 1970s and 1980s as well as separatist terrorism in Corsica and Basque regions; and finally Islamic terrorism since the 1990s. While the identity of the Black Friday November 13, 2015 attackers is still under investigation, France has been, over the years, the victim of both international and homegrown terrorism. Already in 2005, the Director of the Direction de la Surveillance du Territoire (DST), (now the General Directorate for Internal Security) stated that: “the French jihadi has rougher edges, is younger, but also is more radicalized and engaged than in previous years”.

Overview of the Attack

On Friday, November 13, 2015, six or seven simultaneous terrorist attacks took place throughout Paris. According to various sources, 129 people were killed in the attacks (including 89 in the Bataclan concert hall) and more than 350 were injured. At least 7 terrorists were involved in these “organized multifaceted” attacks which included mass shootings, hostage takings, and suicide attacks. The 7 terrorists were dead after carrying out suicide attacks - the first ones ever on French soil.

Three terrorists detonated their suicide belts and died around the national football stadium, Stade the France, at 21:20, 21:30 and 21:53. Another terrorist exploded at 21:40 in a restaurant on Boulevard Voltaire, injuring several victims, and at least three other terrorists carried out a multiple suicide attack after killing more than 80 people in the Bataclan Concert Hall.

The French Prosecutor in charge of the case, François Molins described the event:

- At 21:20, during the football match between France and Germany a first explosion took place in Gate B of the stadium.
- In the 10th district, terrorists in a black SEAT car shot and killed 15 people and injured many.
- At 21:30 another suicide attacker exploded at the Gate H of the Stade the France.
• At 21:32, in the 19th District, individuals on board a black SEAT car began shooting. Hundreds of bullets were found on the streets.
• At 21:36, on Charonne Street in the 11th district, a terrorist stormed out of a black SEAT car and killed 19 people and injured many others who were sitting in a restaurant.
• At 21:40, three individuals entered the Bataclan Concert Hall and started shooting and taking people hostage. Witnesses claim that the terrorists referred to Iraq and Syria during the attack.
• At 21:53, a third suicide attack took place next to the Stade the France.
• At 00:20, French Special Forces took control of the Bataclan and three terrorists were killed / detonated their explosives.

In addition to the reference to Iraq and Syria, the attackers mentioned France’s involvement in Syria, as well as the insult against the Prophet Mohammed.

As November 15, 2015, French police established that at least 3 of the terrorists were of French nationality and that some operational preparation took place in Belgium. At least two terrorists lived in Brussels, one of them, in its suburbs, in Molenbeek, a hotbed of radicalization. In the afternoon, French police announced that Abdelslam Salah, living in Brussels and born in 1989, could have been the eight terrorists. His brother, Ibrahim may, according to the Washington Post, be one of the suicide attackers that died in the attacks. The American newspaper mentions a third name: Bilal Hadfi, living as well in Belgium and travelled to Syria.

![Police call for evidence](image)

**Police calls on public to help identify Abdeslam Salah**

Besides Salah, two other terrorists were formally identified: Ismael Omar Mostefai, born in 1985, was under the intelligence radar and already known by the ministry of Justice for petty
crime. French police are currently investigating if Mostefai travelled to Syria to train in a camp of the Islamic State in 2014.

The French Prosecutor, François Molins, confirmed that one Syrian passport was found in Saint-Denis. It belongs to Ahmed Almohammad, a Syrian, born in 1990, and was used in Greece in order to seek asylum. The last item is still under investigation.

Responsibility

ISIS claimed responsibility of the attack. On a message posted in Arabic, French and English throughout various social media sites, ISIS wrote that the targets were “precisely chosen” and included “the Stade de France stadium during a soccer match – between the teams of Germany and France, both of which are Crusader nations – attended by (...) François Hollande”. The French President was evacuated safely from the stadium. Another attack took place against the Bataclan, a concert hall in Paris which has witnessed a thwarted attack and several terrorist threats in recent years. ISIS also threatened France with more attacks: “Let France and all nations following its path know that they will continue to be at the top of the target list of the Islamic State (...). Indeed this is just the beginning. It is also a warning for any who wishes to take heed”.

However, ISIS’ claim of responsibility did not include any details on the identity or profile of the perpetrators and included mainly information which can easily be found in the press.
French authorities rapidly responded to the event and decided to re-establish identity checkpoints at their borders. It is important to note that the announcement was made at the beginning of the month, in light of the United Nations COP 21 Conference on Sustainable Innovation that is scheduled to take place on December 7-8, 2015. Plan Red Alpha was activated and consequently France decided as well to close its borders, universities, and some public transportation, as well as governmental offices. Anna Hidalgo, the Mayor of Paris, also called upon the citizens of Paris to stay inside their homes until further notice.
France enacted a State of Emergency, which strengthens the power of the administrative body in a number of domains; including:

- Calling up thousands of soldiers to secure Paris and French critical infrastructure.
- The authority of the prefecture (the capital city of an administrative division) to establish curfew
- The interdiction to demonstrate in Paris and its areas.

In the evening of November 15, France “massively bombarded” several targets of the Islamic State in Raqqa, destroying two training camps. Washington announced that it will intensify its intelligence and military cooperation with Paris.

**Social Media Discourse on the Paris Attacks**

The attacks received wide coverage on social media networks by jihad activists who identify with ISIS, and many called for the start of a network campaign about the attacks – mostly under the hashtag “Paris is burning” in Arabic: #باريس_تشتعل. The goal being to intensify the effect of terror and fear, as well as to earn the admiration and sympathy of the Muslim population.

The network discourse among jihadist activists was mainly characterized by expressions of joy and support for the Islamic State, in light of their successes over the past weeks in carrying out large attacks. A jihadist public relations group called Al Nusra Al-Shaiyya praised the Islamic State for downing the Russian passenger plane above the Sinai Desert, for successful attacks in Beirut's Shi'ite Quarter, and the series of attacks in Paris. A Palestinian jihadist media group called Al-Nusra Al-Maqdisiyya produced banners in honor of the attacks (see three banners below). Other jihadist activists emphasized that this wave of attacks in France should continue, as well as in other Western countries. For example, a jihadist activist tweeted that Paris is at the top of the list of targets, and afterwards Rome should be attacked. Other posters called for more similar attacks in London, Berlin, Rome, and

---

1 [https://twitter.com/usood183/status/665494342606307330](https://twitter.com/usood183/status/665494342606307330)
2 [https://twitter.com/abo33dojana1992/status/665489398998413313](https://twitter.com/abo33dojana1992/status/665489398998413313); the network discourse appears under the following hashtags: #غزوة_باريس; #广州市_击闻; "France is burning"; "Paris Explosions"; "The Paris Invasion"
Another poster promised that the attacks to come will be more serious, and more painful.\(^5\)

Banners uploaded by Al-Nusra Al-Maqdisiya, from left to right: "France under fire", "We swear the fire will burn their faces until we draw smiles on the faces of every Muslim"

"The "Devil" Eiffel Tower's lights were turned off as punishment for the souls of their dead."

The jihadist forum Shumukh Al-Islam, which identifies with the Islamic State, highlighted the topic on its homepage, under the conspicuous title "An Announcement about the blessed invasion into Crusader France". The post included mainly expressions of joy and more threats to attack France and other Western countries.\(^6\) The jihadist media institution Al-Battar, which helps with public relations for the Islamic state, published an article on the subject by a well-known jihadist writer named Gharib al-Ikwan. According to the author, no

---

\(^3\) https://twitter.com/0thedoctor0013/status/665498986040573956
\(^4\) https://twitter.com/ISCaliphate32/status/665623281794424832
\(^5\) https://twitter.com/abiirsabil78/status/665629682281369600
\(^6\) https://shamikh1.info/vb/
significance should be accorded to the question of whether Islamic State fighters or members of another organization carried out the terror attacks in France. He claimed that the main significance lies in the wave of attacks over the last two weeks, which prove that the Muslim people has awoken from its slumber and desires to avenge an array of humiliations and debasements to the honor of Muslims by the West and its partners over the course of history. Also according to al-Ikwan, this revenge was asserted against Russia with the downing of the Russian passenger plane over the Sinai Desert, against Shi’ites with a suicide attack in Beirut, against the French with the attacks in Paris, and against the United States with the attack at the training centre in Jordan. He wrote that this wave of terror attacks is destined to continue, and that Paris will remain under Muslim attack. He emphasized that no mercy should be displayed towards Western countries, and particularly not towards French, for they have committed horrific crimes against humanity over the course of history – such as France's massacre of the Algerian people, the United States’ nuclear attack on Japan, the bombing of children in Iraq, and so on. Al-Ikwan went on to allege that the involvement of Western States in the matters of Islamic countries, such as the occupation of Palestine, Afghanistan, and Iraq, only can the flames of the desire for revenge. In conclusion, he wrote that the Muslims will surely be victorious in this campaign.7

In another article published by the jihadist media institution Al-Battar, titled "A Message to the Apostates of the Heretic West", by a writer named Gharib al-Sururiyya, a similar idea was expressed. Western interference in the internal matters of Muslims in Muslim countries will not earn the West peace and security, but will lead to severe upheavals in its territories. According to this author, the Islamic State has announced that it intends "to transfer its campaign to your countries and it will succeed in fulfilling its promise, for it has faith in the power of Allah", and is not unnerved by airplanes, soldiers, or any other weapon in enemy hands. He also emphasized that the attempts by Western countries to fight against the Islamic State and to thwart it plans to implement Shari’a laws will be met with failure.8

7 https://shamikh1.info/vb/
8 https://shamikh1.info/vb/showthread.php?t=250527
On the left: the banner for Gharib al-Ikwan’s article. On the right: the banner for Gharib al-Sururiyya’s article with an image of the Eiffel Tower in France and Big Ben in London.

Below is a selection of banners uploaded by posters to the social network Twitter, in praise of the attacks in Paris:

Paris is burning

A banner with an old quote by Mohammad al-Adnani, spokesman for the Islamic State

The highlighted words read: "Crusaders, we want Paris before Rome and Andalusia."
A banner threatening to once again burn the United States.

Recommendations

Organized attacks by terrorist groups, contrary to independent initiatives of lone wolves, are the most lethal and take the biggest toll of casualties. In attacks of this kind, there are also many more accomplices involved in the secret operations, including activists who initiated the attack, planned it, laid the groundwork for the operation, trained the terrorists and, of course, those who actually carried out the attacks. These attacks, therefore, allow intelligence agents a theoretical ability to infiltrate and thwart attacks more effectively than in the case of the lone wolf. With this in mind, the French security services in particular and the Europeans in general must carry out a thorough self-examination to discover how an attack of this scale went unnoticed beneath their radar. The French must develop better intelligence capabilities alongside a more effective doctrine to cope with terrorism.

An effective ability to cope with terror requires a deeper understanding of the rationale behind the terrorists’ actions, such as their cost-benefit considerations, and their motives (while distinguishing between “root ideological motivations” and “instrumental motivations”) in concretely executing their attacks. An analysis must be made of the operational abilities of terrorist organizations – its methods of action, recruitment and training, the kinds of attacks it is capable of executing, its physical, human and operational infrastructure, its deployment, its psychological warfare doctrines, and more. At the same

---

time, a country coping with terror must take into account the “democratic dilemma” emerging from the need to maximize the effectiveness of the war against terror while preserving its own liberal democratic values.

France and Europe must now develop the appropriate legislation to grant the essential prerogative of security services to effectively combat terror, while at the same time preserving the necessary proportionality in their actions. In this context, Europe and France should reconsider and reassess their policies on foreign migrants, their border control of migrants entering their countries, and their agreements to allow free travel from one country in Europe to another.

Europe has to develop new ways of advancing multicultural integration, so that only those migrants who are ready to declaratively accept the liberal democratic values of a European state will be granted citizenship.

European states must reassess the threats and their vulnerability to terrorist attacks by using advanced analytical methodology and war games. They must establish new counter-terror units and upgrade the abilities of the existing ones to provide an effective response to complex, multi-locational, integrated and simultaneous terrorist attacks. They must allocate the necessary funding to fight terror effectively and they must improve their intelligence infiltrations by strengthening their HUMINT (human intelligence), COMINT (communication intelligence) and OSINT (open sources intelligence) capabilities with a special emphasis on social media.

A balance must be achieved between countering the operational abilities of terrorist organizations via a continuous operational battle involving targeted killings of terrorists, arrests of terrorists, harming their military and operational infrastructure, and drying out their financial sources, among other things, while at the same time dealing with the motivations and motives for terrorism.
This must all be pursued while acknowledging the current contradiction between the two, which finds expression in the phrase, “the boomerang effect” – the success of the state battle against terrorist organizations raises their desire for revenge.

In addition, a balance must be found between the need to call a spade a spade, and recognizing that the common denominator in most of the terrorists carrying out such attacks is their similar political-religious, Islamist-jihadist worldview. These terrorists are trying to impose their radical interpretation of Islam aimed at imposing their views of religious Islam on the whole world, and they are ready to do so by conducting terror attacks. It must be recognized that such terror attacks are aimed at advancing the establishment of both local and global Islamist caliphates that would operate under Sharia Law. But while addressing these understandings, the fact that these dangerous terrorists and their supporters hardly represent a small minority within the Muslim world cannot be ignored, and therefore, there is a danger of throwing out the baby with the bathwater by not equating Islam and Muslims with these dangerous extremist terrorists. Thus, it is essential that governments not take an ostrich approach combining lip service and political correctness with appeasement to the Muslim world while disregarding the extremist Islamist component of the phenomenon – the public. Indeed, one must avoid an Islamophobic response that ignores the fact that we are talking about a very small minority in the Muslim world, as dangerous as it is, that is seeking to impose its extremist views on the entire Muslim world through its radical interpretation of Islam.

Many Western decision-makers don’t understand how much these fragile balances need to be taken into consideration while contending with terrorism, and therefore they are failing to establish much needed effective counter terrorism doctrines.

Decision-makers must recognize the fact that you do not thwart terrorist attacks by promoting your values, but by neutralizing their motivating forces through a nonstop battle against those who carry out terrorist attacks, and their backers. However, this battle must be waged while preserving the liberal democratic values of the western world.
European countries and other countries worldwide must improve the cooperation between their internal intelligence and security agencies, and the international collaboration between these agencies and all the other bodies occupied with coping with global terror. An alternative retribution policy must be formulated – one which provides a solution to the radicalization processes occurring with the prisons themselves. Countries around the world cannot wait until terror attacks occur, and their policies must be proactive in order to prevent attacks before they are carried out. This obligates the countries to take action at the points of origin, training, and activities of the terror organizations in Middle East countries, Syria, Iraq, North Asian countries, and other countries. The terror organizations cannot be permitted to instil fear with their threats, and in that context it is forbidden to adopt dangerous isolationist policies.

To reiterate: the most effective way to fight terror is through the art of finding the right balance - of moving towards a balance between effective counter terrorism and a country's liberal-democratic values.

The apparent trend in the Western world leans towards transferring the focus from counter terrorism to Countering Violent Extremism (CVE). This trend which is intended "not to provoke", not to cause any alienation among the Muslims is extremely dangerous. True cooperation with the Muslim world in the struggle against Islamic-jihadist terrorists is crucial and is a lofty goal. But the discourse with the moderate majority in the Muslim world cannot start from a point of self-deprecation. It should be instead wise and courageous, and should be based upon a shared understanding that there is no problem with the Islamic religion, but that there is a serious problem today within the Islamic religion. A problem that gives birth to unprecedented terror, political violence, and atrocities. The moderate Muslim majority must wake up and speak out against the resonant and menacing minority that is snatching their religion out from under their feet. For if they don't act now, they will be the ones who will ultimately pay the price of Islamophobia. This is not a matter of a favour that the Muslims owe to the Western world. They need to save their own religion - Islam - from the jihadist Islamists. The concept of CVE is by definition working against this goal. Furthermore, it is easier for the moderate Muslim to identify with a struggle against terror than a struggle against violent extremists. Furthermore, the problem does not lie necessarily with any specific terror organization such as the Islamic State or Al-Qaeda, or any other jihadist
organizations. The problem is with the dangerous political-religious ideology which is expressed through a specific type of political violence – terrorism. This ideology was adopted in the past by Al-Qaeda, and today mainly the Islamic State is promoting it. Even if tomorrow the world succeeded in eliminating those organizations, the ideology – if not dealt with correctly – would live on with the establishment of other organizations who would strive to force a Caliphate state on the entire world by means of terror attacks.
### Appendix - Selected Terrorist Incidents Directed at France

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Date</th>
<th>Incident</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>November 1957</td>
<td>Shootings in a market at Livri-Garagan by Algerian independentists.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1962</td>
<td>Nine terrorist attacks by the OAS including an attempt against French President, General Charles de Gaulle.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>December 1973</td>
<td>Terrorist attack in front of the Algeria Consulate by the Charles Martel Group, 4 people dead and 20 injured.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>January 1975</td>
<td>A Palestinian group led by Carlos fired a rocket against El Al at Orly airport, injuring 3. A Palestinian group led by Carlos attacked an El Al plane at Orly airport, injuring 20 people.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>April 1979</td>
<td>Eight attacks against Parisian banks by the FLNC.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>October 1980</td>
<td>Bomb planted outside a synagogue, killing four people died and injuring eleven.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>March 1982</td>
<td>A bomb explodes aboard a Paris-Toulouse express train, killing five and injuring 27.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>August 1982</td>
<td>Seven terrorist attacks against Jewish targets in Paris kill six and wound 29, including an attack at a kosher restaurant on the Rue de Rosiers that killed six and wounded 22.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>October 1983</td>
<td>A Hezbollah truck bomb explodes at the headquarters of the French contingent of the Multinational Peacekeeping Force in Beirut, Lebanon, killing 58 French soldiers.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>February- March 1986</td>
<td>Over the course of six weeks, five bombs explode in stores throughout Paris and on a Paris-Lyons TGV. Two others, including one atop the Eiffel Tower, are found and defused. Two people died and 67 were injured.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>September 1986</td>
<td>Over the course of two weeks, 5 bombs explode in various restaurants and government buildings around Paris, killing 8 and wounding 165, including 5 killed and 52 wounded in a shop.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>September 1989</td>
<td>A bomb planted on a French DC-10 (UTA 772) explodes en route from Brazzaville to Paris killing all 170 aboard.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>December 1994</td>
<td>An Air France flight from Algiers to Paris is hijacked. French commandos stormed the plane on the tarmac in Marseille, killing the hijackers.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>July- September 1995</td>
<td>Over the course of six weeks, several bombs explode in transit stations and crowded public areas in Paris, killing 10 and wounding over 150.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>May 2002</td>
<td>A suicide car bomb in Karachi, Pakistan kills 14, including 11 French Naval engineers.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>October 2002</td>
<td>Suicide bombers in small boat ram the French oil tanker <em>Limburg</em> off the coast of Yemen, killing one and setting the tanker ablaze.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>October 2004</td>
<td>An attack against the Indonesian embassy in Paris by the Armed Islamic Front (FIS) wounded 10 people.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Date</td>
<td>Event Description</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>------------</td>
<td>-------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>August 2009</td>
<td>A suicide attack against the French Embassy in Mauritania injured two people.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>March 2012</td>
<td>Between March 11th and 19th, Mohammed Merah, 22, a French citizen of Algerian origin, who was a member of Forsane Alizza (Knights of Glory), carried out a series of shooting attacks targeting French soldiers and Jewish civilians in Toulouse and Montauban. Seven people were killed and five others were injured. On 22 March, Merah was shot by police, after engaging in a 24 hour long firefight.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>January 2015</td>
<td>On January 7, 2015, brothers Saïd and Chérif Kouachi, stormed offices of the Charlie Hebdo journal in Paris, killing 11 journalists and wounding 11 others. The attackers escaped and police launched a major manhunt for them. On January 8, municipal police officer Clarissa Jean-Philippe was fatally shot by an armed gunman in Montrouge, a suburb of Paris. On January 9, French police located Saïd and Chérif Kouachi at a printing shop 20km outside Paris. The attackers took two people hostage. Police engaged in a firefight and fatally shot the brothers. Two police officers were injured. The hostages were released. In a separate but related incident, also on January 9, another gunman, later identified Amedy Coulibaly, took 15 people hostage in the kosher supermarket, ‘Hyper-Cache’ in Paris.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>April 2015</td>
<td>On April 22, French police arrested Sid Ahmed Ghlam, 24 accused of planning to carry out a terrorist attack targeting several churches in Villejuif, near Paris. Ghlam was known to authorities for posting messages on social media supporting jihadist activities in Syria. He was also accused of killing French citizen Aurelie Chatelain.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>June 2015</td>
<td>On June 27, 2015 several people were injured by a large explosion that occurred at the Air Products factory, a US owned Gas Company near Lyon. As police investigated, the decapitated head of the factory owner, who was identified as Herve Cornora, 50, was discovered on the factory railings. A black Islamist flag with Arabic writing was found flying on the factory railings. Authorities arrested four people, including the main perpetrator who was identified as Yassin Sahli, 35.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>August 2015</td>
<td>On August 21, 2015, Ayoub el-Qahzzani, a Moroccan man, 26 armed with a Kalashnikov, a knife, and an automatic pistol and cartridges, attempted to open fire on passengers on an express train from Amsterdam to Paris. The attacker was overpowered by two US marines who were passengers on the train and arrested by police.</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>